CONTENTS

Preface xxiii
Acknowledgments xxix

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION 1

The Role of Remedies 1
Classifying Remedies 2
Substitutionary and Specific Remedies 4
Legal and Equitable Remedies 5
Note on the Nature of Remedies 6

CHAPTER 2

PAYING FOR HARM: COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 9

A. The Basic Principle: Restoring Plaintiff to His Rightful Position 9
   United States v. Hatahley 9
   Notes on the Basic Principle 12
B. Value as the Measure of the Rightful Position 15
   In re September 11th Litigation 15
   Notes on Market Value 18
   Notes on “Value to the Owner” 20
   Trinity Church v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co. 22
   Notes on Special-Purpose Property 25
   Notes on Repair Costs 26
   Notes on Property That Fluctuates in Value 27
C. Expectancy and Reliance as Measures of the Rightful Position 28
   Neri v. Retail Marine Corp. 28
   Notes on § 2-708(2) and Attempts to Codify Remedies 30
   Notes on Expectancy and Reliance 32
   Notes on Compensating Expectancies 34
   Chatlos Systems, Inc. v. National Cash Register Corp. 36
   Notes on Excessive Expectancies 38
   Smith v. Bolles 39
   Notes on Expectancy in Tort 40
### Contents

#### D. Consequential Damages
- *Buck v. Morrow*  
  Notes on General and Special Damages  
  Notes on the Vocabulary of Damages  
  Notes on Consequential Damages from Failure to Pay Money  
- *Texaco, Inc. v. Pennzoil Co.*  
  Notes on an 11-Figure Verdict

#### E. Limits on Damages
1. The Parties’ Power to Specify the Remedy
   - *Kearney & Trecker Corp. v. Master Engraving Co.*  
     Notes on Limitation-of-Remedy Clauses  
  Notes on Limitation-of-Remedy Clauses  
  Notes on Liquidated-Damage and Penalty Clauses  
  Notes on Underliquidated-Damage Clauses
2. Avoidable Consequences, Offsetting Benefits, and Collateral Sources
   - *S.J. Groves & Sons Co. v. Warner Co.*  
   Notes on Avoidable Consequences  
   Notes on Offsetting Benefits  
   - *Oden v. Chemung County Industrial Development Agency*  
     Notes on the Collateral-Source Rule
3. The Scope of Liability
   - *Pruitt v. Allied Chemical Corp.*  
   Notes on the Scope of Liability  
   Notes on the Economic-Loss Rules  
- *Sunnyland Farms, Inc. v. Central New Mexico Electric Cooperative, Inc.*  
  Notes on the Collateral-Source Rule  
  More Notes on the Scope of Liability
4. Substantive Policy Goals
   - *Brunswick Corp. v. Pueblo Bowl-O-Mat*  
   Notes on Remedial Implications of Substantive Policy
5. The Requirement of Reasonable Certainty
   - *Bigelow v. RKO Radio Pictures*  
   Notes on the Requirement of Reasonable Certainty  
   Notes on Litigating Commercial Damages

#### F. Taxes, Time, and the Value of Money
1. The Impact of Taxes
   - *Norfolk & Western Railway v. Liepelt*  
   Notes on Taxes
2. Interest on Past Damages
   - *City of Milwaukee v. Cement Division, National Gypsum Co.*  
   Notes on Interest
3. The Net Present Value of Future Damages
   - *Jones & Laughlin Steel Corp. v. Pfeifer*  
   Notes on Discounting to Present Value  
   Notes on Race- and Sex-Based Data

#### G. Damages Where Value Cannot Be Measured in Dollars
1. Personal Injuries and Death
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Debus v. Grand Union Stores</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Pain and Suffering</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Wrongful Death</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Controversy over Tort Law</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arbino v. Johnson &amp; Johnson</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on the Constitutionality of Limiting Tort Remedies</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on the Empirical Debate: How Big Is the Problem?</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Valuing Pain and Suffering and Human Life</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Dignitary and Constitutional Harms</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Levka v. City of Chicago</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Valuing Emotional Distress</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Judicial Review of Jury Verdicts</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Recovering for Emotional Distress</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carey v. Piphus</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Valuing Constitutional Rights</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### CHAPTER 3

**PUNITIVE REMEDIES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Punitive Damages</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Common Law and Statutes</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Punitive Damages</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Measuring Punitive Damages</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Constitution</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phillip Morris USA v. Williams</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Punitive Damages in Contract</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formosa Plastics Corp. USA v. Presidio Engineers and Contractors, Inc.</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Punitive Damages in Contract</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Other Punitive Remedies</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Statutory Recoveries by Private Litigants</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Civil Penalties Payable to the Government</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### CHAPTER 4

**PREVENTING HARM: THE MEASURE OF INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. The Scope of Injunctions</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Preventing Wrongful Acts</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almurati v. Bush</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes on Ripeness</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marshall v. Goodyear Tire &amp; Rubber Co.</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes on the Scope of Injunctions to Prevent Wrongful Acts 224
Notes on Individual Injunctions, Class Injunctions, and Nationwide Injunctions 226
*United States v. W.T. Grant Co.* 228
Notes on Voluntary Cessation of Wrongful Acts 230

2. Preventing Lawful Acts That Might Have Wrongful Consequences 232
Notes on Ripeness and Uncertain Consequences 233
*PepsiCo, Inc. v. Redmond* 235
Notes on Prophylactic Injunctions 238

3. Repairing the Consequences of Past Wrongful Conduct 243
*Forster v. Boss* 243
Notes on Reparative Injunctions 245
Notes on Coordinating Multiple Remedies 247
*Winston Research Corp. v. Minnesota Mining & Manufacturing Co.* 248
Notes on Reparative Injunctions and the Rightful Position 250
*Bailey v. Proctor* 251
Notes on Equitable Discretion 254

4. Institutional Reform Litigation (Structural Injunctions) 255
Introductory Note: The School Desegregation Cases 255
*Brown v. Plata* 258
Notes on the Prison Cases 272
Notes on Paying for the Remedy 274
Notes on the Future of Institutional Reform Litigation 275

B. Modifying Injunctions 276
Introductory Notes 276
*Horne v. Flores* 278
Notes on Modification of Degrees 286
Notes on Modification Under the Prison Litigation Reform Act 288
Notes on Modifying School Desegregation Decrees—and Maybe Decrees More Generally 288

C. The Rights of Third Parties 290
*Hills v. Gautreaux* 290
Notes on Relief Against Third Parties 293
*General Building Contractors Association v. Pennsylvania* 296
More Notes on Relief Against Third Parties 299

**CHAPTER 5**

**CHOOSING REMEDIES** 303

A. Substitutionary or Specific Relief 303
1. Irreplaceable Losses 303
   a. Injunctions 303
      *Pardee v. Camden Lumber Co.* 303
F.W. Maitland, Equity 306
Note on Equity in the United States 308
Notes on the Reasons for the Irreparable Injury Rule 308
Brook v. James A. Cullimore & Co. 311
Notes on Replevin and Injunctions 312
Continental Airlines, Inc. v. Intra Brokers, Inc. 313
Notes on the Content of the Irreparable Injury Rule 315

b. Specific Performance of Contracts 318
Campbell Soup Co. v. Wentz 318
Notes on Specific Performance of Contracts 319
Notes on Efficient Breach of Contract 321
Notes on Specific Performance Where Cover Is Possible 324
Van Wagner Advertising Group v. S & M Enterprises 325
Notes on Irreparable Injury and Undue Hardship 328
Notes on Personal Service Contracts 330

2. Burdens on Defendant or the Court 331
Whitlock v. Hilander Foods, Inc. 331
Notes on Undue Hardship 333
Notes on the Economics of Undue Hardship 335
Lord & Taylor LLC v. White Flint, L.P. 336
Notes on Practicality and Private Litigation 341

3. Other Policy Reasons 342
Willing v. Mazzocone 342
Notes on Defamation Damages and Insolvent Defendants 346
Notes on Prior Restraints 347
Notes on the Right to Jury Trial 349
Notes on Avoiding a “Multiplicity of Suits” 350

eBay, Inc. v. MercExchange, LLC 351
Notes on Confusion in the Supreme Court 353

B. Preliminary or Permanent Relief 357
1. The Substantive Standards for Preliminary Relief 357
Winter v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. 357
Notes on Preliminary Relief 361
Notes on Preserving the Status Quo 366
Coyne-Delany Co. v. Capital Development Board 367
Notes on Injunction Bonds 369

2. The Procedure for Obtaining Preliminary Relief 371
Carroll v. President and Commissioners of Princess Anne 371
Notes on Temporary Restraining Orders 374
Sampson v. Murray 375
More Notes on Irreparable Injury 380
Notes on Preliminary Procedure 380

C. Prospective or Retrospective Relief 385
1. Suits Against Officers in Their Official Capacities 385
Edelman v. Jordan 385
Notes on Prospective-Only Remedies 389
Notes on the Evolution of Eleventh Amendment Doctrine 392
Notes on the Reasons for Sovereign Immunity 396

2. Suits Against Officers in Their Personal Capacities
   (and the Doctrine of Qualified Immunity) 398
   *Harlow v. Fitzgerald* 398
   Notes on Qualified Official Immunity 402
   Notes on the Fear of Damage Remedies 409

CHAPTER 6

REMEDIES AND SEPARATION OF POWERS 411

A. More on Governmental Immunities 411
   1. Consented Suits Against the Government 411
      *Stone v. North Carolina Department of Labor* 411
      Notes on the Public Duty Doctrine 415
      Notes on the Governmental/Proprietary Distinction 419
      Notes on the Discretionary Function Exception 420
      Notes on Federal Waivers of Immunity 422
   2. Suits Against Officers—Absolute Immunity 424
      *Van de Kamp v. Goldstein* 424
      Notes on Prosecutorial Immunity 430
      Notes on Other Absolute Immunities 433
B. Creating Causes of Action 438
   *Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents* 438
   Notes on Implied Remedies for Constitutional Violations 441
   Notes on Implied Remedies for Statutory Violations 444
   *Armstrong v. Exceptional Child Center, Inc.* 447
   Notes on Enforcing Federal Statutes with Injunctions 452
C. The Right to Jury Trial 453
   *Chauffeurs Local No. 391 v. Terry* 453
   Notes on the Evolution of the Federal Right to Jury Trial 460
   Notes on Characterizing Claims as Legal or Equitable 463

CHAPTER 7

PREVENTING HARM WITHOUT COERCION: DECLARATORY REMEDIES 467

A. Declaratory Judgments 467
   1. The General Case 467
      *Nashville, Chattanooga, & St. Louis Railway v. Wallace* 467
      Notes on Declaratory Judgments and Ripeness 469
      Notes on Declaratory Judgments, Irreparable Injury, and Supplemental Relief 471
CHAPTER 8

BENEFIT TO DEFENDANT AS THE MEASURE OF RELIEF: RESTITUTION

A. Restitution from Innocent Defendants—and Some Who Are Treated as Innocent 505
   1. Introducing Restitution—Mistake 505
      Blue Cross Health Services, Inc. v. Sauer 505
      Introductory Notes on Restitution 507
      Notes on the Grounds for Restitution 511
      Somerville v. Jacobs 512
      Notes on Mistaken Improvers 515
      Notes on Other Grounds for Restitution 518
   2. Measuring Restitution from the Innocent—and More Restitutionary Causes of Action 519
      Bonina v. Sheppard 519
      Notes on Measuring Restitution from Innocent Defendants 523
      Farash v. Sykes Datatronics, Inc. 525
      Notes on the Benefit Requirement 528
      More Notes on the Murky Borders of Contract and Restitution 530
   B. Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost 532
      1. Disgorging the Profits of Conscious Wrongdoers 532
         Olwell v. Nye & Nissen Co. 532
         Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost 534
         Notes on the Restitutionary Causes of Action Against Wrongdoers 538
Maier Brewing Co. v. Fleischmann Distilling Corp. 540
More Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost 542
2. Measuring the Profits 545
   Sheldon v. Metro-Goldwyn Pictures Corp. 545
   Notes on Apportioning Profits 549
   Hamil America, Inc. v. GFI 551
   Notes on Calculating Profits 556
3. Breach of Contract 557
   a. Disgorging the Profits from Opportunistic Breach 557
      May v. Muroff 557
      Notes on Disgorging the Profits from Breach of Contract 558
   b. Rescission 562
      Mobil Oil Exploration & Producing Southeast, Inc. v. United States 562
      Notes on Rescission for Breach of Contract 564
      Notes on Election of Remedies 566
      Notes on Other Grounds for Rescission 567
C. Restitutionary Rights in Specific Property 568
   1. Constructive Trusts 568
      Paoloni v. Goldstein 568
      Notes on Constructive Trusts 570
      Ruffin v. Ruffin 572
      More Notes on Constructive Trusts 574
      In re Leitner 575
      Notes on Constructive Trusts in Bankruptcy 578
   2. Tracing the Property 580
      In re Erie Trust Co. 580
      Notes on Tracing 583
      In re JD Services, Inc. 586
      Notes on the Mechanics of Tracing 588
      Notes on Advanced Tracing Issues 590
      Tracing Problems 591
   3. Equitable Liens and Subrogation 592
      In re Mesa 592
      Notes on Equitable Liens 595
      Mort v. United States 597
      Notes on Subrogation 600
D. Defenses and the Rights of Third Parties 602
   1. Bona Fide Purchasers 602
      Newton v. Porter 602
      Notes on Tracing into the Hands of Third Parties 604
   2. Payment for Value 607
      Banque Worms v. BankAmerica International 607
      Notes on Paying Debts with Other People’s Property 611
E. Replevin, Ejectment, and the Like 613
CHAPTER 9

ANCILLARY REMEDIES: ENFORCING THE JUDGMENT 617

A. Enforcing Coercive Orders: The Contempt Power 617
1. The Three Kinds of Contempt 617
   *International Union, United Mine Workers v. Bagwell* 617
   Notes on the Three Kinds of Contempt 624
   Notes on Coercive Contempt 626
   *Colin Diver, The Judge as Political Powerbroker: Superintending Structural Change in Public Institutions* 629
2. How Much Risk of Abuse to Overcome How Much Defiance? 630
   a. Perpetual Coercion? 630
      *Anyanwu v. Anyanwu* 630
      Notes on Perpetual Coercion 633
   b. Anticipatory Contempt 637
      *Griffin v. County School Board* 637
      Notes on Contempt of Anticipated Injunctions 641
      Notes on Contempt Statutes 642
3. The Collateral Bar Rule 643
   *Walker v. City of Birmingham* 643
   Notes on the Duty to Obey Erroneous Injunctions 650
   *John Leubsdorf, Constitutional Civil Procedure* 653
4. The Rights of Third Parties 654
   *Planned Parenthood Golden Gate v. Garibaldi* 654
   Notes on Contempt Proceedings Against Third Parties 658
   Notes on the Array of Theories for Binding Third Parties 661
   Notes on the Notice Requirement 664
5. Drafting Decrees 665
   Notes on the Requirement That Injunctions Be Specific 665
   Notes on the Rule Against Incorporating Other Documents 669
   Drafting Your Own Injunction 671
B. Collecting Money Judgments 672
1. Execution, Garnishment, and the Like 672
   *Credit Bureau, Inc. v. Moninger* 672
   Notes on Execution 674
   Notes on Exemptions 676
   *Dixie National Bank v. Chase* 678
   Notes on Garnishment 679
   Notes on Other Means of Collecting 681
   Note on Bankruptcy 684
   Notes on Collecting Money from the Government 684
2. Coercive Collection of Money 685
   *In re Marriage of Logston* 685
   Notes on Collecting Family Support 690
   More Notes on the Irreparable Injury Rule 694
3. Preserving Assets Before Judgment 695
   *In re Hypnotic Taxi, LLC* 695
   Notes on Attachment 701
   Notes on Prejudgment Freeze Orders 703
   *W.E. Erickson Construction, Inc. v. Congress-Kenilworth Corp.* 704
   Notes on Receivership 707

## CHAPTER 10

MORE ANCILLARY REMEDIES: ATTORNEYS’ FEES 711

A. Fee-Shifting Statutes 711
   *City of Riverside v. Rivera* 711
   Notes on the American Rule 715
   Notes on Exceptions to the American Rule 716
   Notes on One-Way Fee Shifting 719
   Notes on the Amount of the Judgment as a Constraint on Attorneys’ Fees 721
   Notes on the Prevailing-Party Requirement 723
   Notes on Calculating the Lodestar 724

B. Attorneys’ Fees from a Common Fund 726
   *In re Cabletron Systems, Inc. Securities Litigation* 726
   Notes on the Common-Fund Rule 731
   Notes on Contingency Enhancements 733
   Notes on Competing Approaches to Calculating Fee Awards 734

C. Ethical Issues in Fee Awards 738
   *Evans v. Jeff D.* 738
   Notes on Ethical Problems in Fee-Shifting Cases 746
   Notes on Ethical Problems in Common-Fund Cases 749

## CHAPTER 11

REMEDIAL DEFENSES 753

A. Unconscionability and the Equitable Contract Defenses 753
   *James v. National Financial, LLC* 753
   Notes on the Reach of Equitable Defenses 760
   Notes on Unconscionable Contracts 761
   Notes on Arbitration Clauses 762

B. Unclean Hands and *In Pari Delicto* 763
   *Pinter v. Dahl* 763
   Notes on Unclean Hands and *In Pari Delicto* 766

C. Estoppel and Waiver 768
   1. Equitable Estoppel 768
      *Geddes v. Mill Creek Country Club, Inc.* 768
      Notes on Equitable Estoppel 771
Contents

2. Waiver
   Carr-Gottstein Foods Co. v. Wasilla, LLC 773
   Notes on Waiver 777

D. Laches
   Arizona Libertarian Party v. Reagan 779
   Notes on Laches 782
   Notes on the Relation Between Laches and Statutes of Limitations 784

E. Statutes of Limitations 786
   1. Continuing Violations 786
      Klehr v. A.O. Smith Corp. 786
      Notes on Continuing Violations 788
      Notes on Limitations of Federal Claims 791
   2. The Discovery Rule 792
      Debiec v. Cabot Corp. 792
      Notes on the Discovery Rule 798
   3. Fraudulent Concealment 800
      Knaysi v. A.H. Robins Co. 800
      Notes on Fraudulent Concealment 803
      Notes on Estoppel to Assert Limitations 805
      Notes on the Policy Choices in Statutes of Limitations 806

CHAPTER 12

FLUID-CLASS AND CY PRES REMEDIES 809

In re Pharmaceutical Industry Average Wholesale Price Litigation 809
   Notes on Class Actions for Damages 813
   Notes on Fluid-Class Recoveries and Cy Pres Distributions 816
   Notes on Affirmative Action as a Fluid-Class Remedy 819
   Notes on Partly Identifiable Victims 821

APPENDIX

PRESENT VALUE TABLES 823

Table of Cases 827
Table of Statutes, Rules, Constitutions, Treaties, Restatements, and More 841
Table of Secondary Authorities 847
Index 855