CONTENTS

Preface xxvii
Acknowledgments xxxi

CHAPTER ONE

NATURAL RESOURCES LAW AND THE IMPORTANCE OF PLACE 1

A. Overview 2
B. What Are Natural Resources?
   - In Re Tortorelli 3
   - Massachusetts v. Environmental Protection Agency 9
C. The Importance of Place 16
   - The Special Importance of Ordinary Places 16
D. The Trust Notion 19
   - The Planetary Trust: Conservation and Intergenerational Equity 19
   - We Do Not Hold the Earth in Trust 22
   - Juliana v. United States 24
E. What Is Conservation? 27
   - Keeping Faith with Nature 27
   - The Conservation Ethic 29
F. Discussion Problem: Beauty and the Beast 30

PART ONE

FEDERAL LANDS 35

CHAPTER TWO

FEDERAL LANDS: AN INTRODUCTION 37

A. Overview 38
B. Historical Background 40
   1. The Birth of the Federal Public Domain 40
      - Pollard v. Hagan 42
      - United States v. Gardner 48
2. Land Grants to States  53
   
   Branson School District v. Romer  57

3. Grants to Private Parties  63
   
   Foust v. Lujan  64

4. From Grants to Management  70
   United States v. Grimaud  72
   Light v. United States  76

5. Environmental Quality  78

C. The Property Clause: Federal Ownership and Authority  79
   Camfield v. United States  80
   Kleppe v. New Mexico  86
   Minnesota v. Block  91

D. Discussion Problem: Simmering Discontent in the West  96

CHAPTER THREE
FEDERAL AGENCIES: AUTHORITY AND LIMITS  101

A. Overview  102

B. The Legal Framework for Federal Land Management
   Decisions: Some Elements of Place-Based Lawmaking  102
   1. Statutory Mandates and Organic Acts  103
      Everglades National Park Establishment Act of 1947  106
      National Park Service Organic Act of 1916  106
      The National Wildlife Refuge System and the Hallmarks of Modern Organic Legislation  107
   2. Tiered Decisionmaking: Planning and Implementation  111
      The National Wildlife Refuge System and the Hallmarks of Modern Organic Legislation  111
   3. The Judicial Enforceability of Plans and Statutory Mandates  114
      Norton v. Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance  114

C. The National Environmental Policy Act: Environmental Impact Assessment by Federal Agencies  120
   1. Overview  120
   2. Statutory and Regulatory Excerpts  121
      National Environmental Policy Act of 1969  121
      Council on Environmental Quality Regulations on NEPA Implementation  125
   3. Is an EIS Required? The Threshold Issues  132
      Kleppe v. Sierra Club  133
      National Parks & Conservation Association v. Babbitt  138
4. The Scope of Analysis: Cumulative Impacts, Tiering, and Alternatives 145
   Kleppe v. Sierra Club 146
   Sierra Club v. United States 150
5. The Adequacy of the EIS 156
   Robertson v. Methow Valley Citizens Council 157
   Dubois v. U.S. Department of Agriculture 163
6. New Information and the Duty to Supplement NEPA Analyses 167
   Marsh v. Oregon Natural Resources Council 168
7. NEPA’s Impact: Does It Force Better Decisionmaking? 172
   Toward a Smarter NEPA: Monitoring and Managing Government’s Environmental Performance 173
D. Agency Action and the Conduct of Judicial Review Under the APA 176
   1. Overview 176
   2. Statutory Excerpts 177
      The Administrative Procedure Act of 1946 177
   3. The Right to Judicial Review 180
      Citizens to Preserve Overton Park, Inc. v. Volpe 180
   Mausolf v. Babbitt 185
5. Judicial Review of Agencies’ Interpretation of Statutes 189
   Wilderness Watch v. Mainella 190
E. Jurisdictional Limitations on the Availability of Judicial Review 196
   1. Standing 196
      Sierra Club v. Morton 196
      Lujan v. National Wildlife Federation 205
      Friends of the Boundary Waters Wilderness v. Dombeck 217
   2. Finality 221
      Bennett v. Spear 221
   3. Ripeness 225
      Ohio Forestry Association v. Sierra Club 225
4. Exhaustion of Agency Remedies 229
   Kleisler v. U.S. Forest Service 230
F. Discussion Problem: Siting Utility-Scale Solar Generating Facilities on BLM Lands 234
CHAPTER FOUR

NON-FEDERAL POWER ON FEDERAL LANDS 237

A. Overview 238

B. The Authority of State Law on Federal Land 238
   1. Federal Preemption of State Regulation 238
      Omaechevarria v. Idaho 239
      Ventura County v. Gulf Oil Corp. 242
      California Coastal Commission v. Granite Rock Co. 247
      Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance v. Bureau of Land Management 254
   3. Statutory Federalism: Congressionally Defined Roles for States 265
      Coastal Zone Management Act of 1972 265
      California v. Norton 268

C. Collaborative Management of Federal Natural Resources 274
   National Parks & Conservation Association v. Stanton 275

D. Discussion Problem: Burying Nuclear Waste on Federal Land in Nevada 282

CHAPTER FIVE

FORESTS 285

A. Overview 286

B. Discussion Problem: Forest Management 289

C. Foundations of Federal Management: Congress Sets the Stage 292
   Forest Service Organic Act of 1897 294
   The Multiple-Use Sustained-Yield Act of 1960 296

D. The Courts Intervene 299
   Izaak Walton League v. Butz 299

E. Congress Strikes the Balance? 307
   National Forest Management Act of 1976, §1604 307

F. The Courts Intervene, Again 312
   1. The Planning Idea 312
      Sierra Club v. U.S. Forest Service 315
      Sierra Club v. Marita 318
   2. The Standards Idea 325
      Sierra Club v. Espy [I] 326
### Contents

*Sierra Club v. Espy [II]* 330  
*Sierra Club v. Glickman* 332  
*Sierra Club v. Peterson [I]* 335  
*Sierra Club v. Peterson [II]* 336  

3. NFMA and NEPA in Forest Planning 339  

G. Discussion Problem: The 2012 Forest Service Planning Regulations—A New Idea? 341  
National Forest System Land Management Planning Regulations 342  

H. State Forestry Regulation: the California Forest Practice Act 348  
California Forest Practice Act 349  

---

#### CHAPTER SIX  
**RANGELANDS** 357  

A. Overview 358  

B. The BLM and the Management of Public Lands Under FLPMA 359  
Federal Land Policy and Management Act of 1976 360  

C. The Statutory Framework for Federal Rangeland Management 364  
*Public Lands Council v. Babbitt* 365  
Taylor Grazing Act of 1934 367  
Federal Land Policy and Management Act of 1976 371  
Public Rangelands Improvement Act of 1978 373  

D. The Grazer’s Interest in Public Lands 375  
*United States v. Fuller* 375  
*Public Lands Council v. Babbitt* 380  

E. Protecting the Ecological Resources of the Federal Range 385  
*Natural Resources Defense Council v. Morton* 385  
*Natural Resources Defense Council v. Hodel* 390  
*Idaho Watersheds Project v. Hahn* 395  
*Western Watersheds Project v. BLM* 401  

F. Discussion Problem: Grazing Buyouts in the Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monument 409  

---

#### CHAPTER SEVEN  
**HARD ROCK MINERALS** 413  

A. Overview 414  

B. The Mining Law of 1872: Allocation by Self-Initiated Location 417  
1. The Mechanics of the Mining Law 417  
   *The Mining Law of 1872* 417
2. The Rights of Mining Claimants Before Discovery  423
   *Cole v. Ralph* 423
3. The Discovery of Valuable Minerals: The Marketability Test  428
   *United States v. Coleman* 428
4. The Rights of Mining Claimants After Discovery  433
   *United States v. Locke* 433
   *United States v. Rizzinelli* 439
C. Environmental Regulation of Mining Activities on Unpatented Claims  445
   1. Hard Rock Mining on National Forest Lands  445
      *Okanogan Highlands Alliance v. Williams* 445
   2. Hard Rock Mining on BLM Lands  449
      *Mineral Policy Center v. Norton* 449
D. The Future of the Mining Law: Prospects for Reform  456
   Mining Reform Redux, Once More 456
E. Discussion Problem: Open Pit Gold Mining on Native American Sacred Lands 458

---

CHAPTER EIGHT

ENERGY AND THE FEDERAL LANDS: MAKING POLICY FOR THE FUTURE 461

A. Overview 462
B. A Starting Point: The Energy Picture at the Beginning of the Twenty-First Century 463
C. Onshore Oil and Gas Development  466
   1. Oil and Gas Development on Private Lands  468
   2. Oil and Gas Development on Public Lands  469
      *Impact Energy Resources, LLC v. Salazar* 472
      *Western Energy Alliance v. Salazar* 475
   3. Hydraulic Fracturing  481
      *State of Wyoming v. U.S. Dept. of Interior* 483
D. Offshore Oil and Gas Development  494
   The Bureau of Ocean Energy Management’s Five-Year Leasing Program for Offshore Oil and Gas Leasing: History and Proposed Program for 2017-2022 495
   *Defenders of Wildlife v. Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, Regulation, and Enforcement* 500
E. Coal: A Resource in Transition  507
   *Bragg v. W. Va. Coal Ass’n* 510
F. Nuclear Energy  517
   Nuclear Energy: Overview of Congressional Issues 519
National Ass’n of Regulated Utility Comm’rs v. U.S. Dept. of Energy 521

   1. Hydropower Energy Resources 529
      Northwest Resource Information Center, Inc. v. Northwest Power Planning Council 533
   2. Wind Energy 541
      Protect Our Communities Foundation v. Salazar 544
      Public Employees for Envtl. Responsibility v. Hopper 548
   3. Solar Energy 555
      Western Watersheds Project v. Salazar 555


CHAPTER NINE

PARKS, MONUMENTS, WILDERNESS, AND THE ROADLESS RESOURCE 563

A. Overview 564

B. A National Park “System” 566
   Discussion Problem: The National Park System Mandate 568
      Sierra Club v. Department of the Interior 571
      The Fund for Animals v. Norton 575
      International Snowmobile Manufacturers Association v. Norton 580

C. National Monuments: Delegation of Congressional Authority 584
   Antiquities Act of 1906 586
   1. What Happened at Jackson Hole 587
      89 Congressional Record 2233 588
      State of Wyoming v. Franke 590
   2. Grand Staircase-Escalante National Monument 593

D. Wilderness: Congressional Limitation on Executive Control 598
   Wilderness Act of 1964 599
   2. Wilderness Selection 606
   3. Prohibited Activities 610
      The Wilderness Society v. U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service 610

E. The Roadless Resource and the Roadless Rule 616
   Special Areas: Roadless Area Conservation 618
      Wyoming v. U.S. Department of Agriculture 621

F. Discussion Problem: Climate Change, Parks, and Wilderness 628
PART 2
NON-FEDERAL LANDS

CHAPTER TEN
TRIBAL LANDS AND RESOURCES

A. Overview
B. Discussion Problem: Standing Rock and the Dakota Access Pipeline
C. Native American Sovereignty And Federal Trust
   Felix S. Cohen’s Handbook of Federal Indian Law
   United States v. Mitchell
D. Native American Resources on the Federal Conservation Estate
   Lyng v. Northwest Indian Cemetery Protective Association
   Bear Lodge Multiple Use Association v. Babbitt
E. Natural Resources Crossing Tribal-State Borders
   Puyallup Tribe, Inc. v. Washington Department of Game (Puyallup III)
   Minnesota v. Mille Lacs Band of Chippewa Indians
F. Discussion Problem: Native American Resources and Climate Change

CHAPTER ELEVEN
STATE LANDS: THE PUBLIC TRUST DOCTRINE

A. Overview
B. In the Beginning: Oyster Wars and Railroads
   Martin v. Waddell’s Lessee
   Illinois Central Railroad Co. v. Illinois
C. The Scope of the Trust: The Concept of Navigability
   The Daniel Ball
   Utah v. United States
   PPL Montana LLC v. Montana
D. The Trustee: The Authority and Duty of the States
   Defenders of Wildlife v. Hull
E. The Trust Purposes: Benefits Accruing to the Public
   National Audubon Society v. Superior Court (Mono Lake)
   Neptune City v. Avon-by-the-Sea
Contents

F. Beyond the Federal Title Test: Navigability for Use
   People v. Emmert 720
   Montana Coalition for Stream Access, Inc. v. Hildreth 723
G. Onto Dry Land and into the Air?
   Daytona Beach v. Tona-Rama, Inc. 726
   Alec L. v. Jackson 732
   Juliana v. United States 734
H. Discussion Problem: Climate Change and Rising Seas
   Climate Change Impacts in the United States 741
   Dynamic Property Rights: The Public Trust Doctrine and
   Takings in a Changing Climate 742

CHAPTER TWELVE

PRIVATE LANDS: CONSERVATION TRANSACTIONS 749

A. Overview 750
   Land Trusts: Key Elements in the Struggle Against Sprawl 752
   Enhancing Conservation Options: An Argument for
   Statutory Recognition of Options to Purchase
   Conservation Easements 755
B. What Is a Conservation Easement? 760
   Uniform Conservation Easement Act 761
   Hicks v. Dowd 765
   Rethinking the Perpetual Nature of Conservation Easements 770
C. Land Trusts, Conservation Easements, and Tax Incentives 776
   Charitable Contributions and Gifts 776
   Glass v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue 780
   Great Northern Nekoosa Corp. v. United States 788
D. Discussion Problem: Options for a Rancher 792

PART 3

ACROSS THE BOUNDARIES 795

CHAPTER THIRTEEN

WILDLIFE AND THE ENDANGERED SPECIES ACT 797

A. Overview 798
   Some Principles of Conservation Biology, as They Apply to
   Environmental Law 799
B. Constitutional Foundations of Wildlife Law 804
   1. A Place to Start 804
      *Geer v. Connecticut* 804
   2. The Treaty Power 810
      *Missouri v. Holland* 810
   3. The Property Clause 813
   4. The Commerce Clause 815
      *Gibbs v. Babbitt* 817
      *Rancho Viejo, LLC v. Norton* 822
C. The Endangered Species Act of 1973 827
   The Endangered Species Act of 1973 827
   1. Listing Under Section 4 (Deciding What to Protect) 836
      *Western Watersheds Project v. U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service* 836
      *U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Vertebrate Population Policy* 841
      *Defenders of Wildlife v. Salazar* 844
      *Defenders of Wildlife v. Norton* 851
      Policy for Evaluation of Conservation Efforts When Making Listing Decisions (*Pece Policy*) 858
      Discussion Problem: The Decision Not to List the Dunes Sagebrush Lizard 861
   2. Consultation, Jeopardy, and Adverse Modification Under Section 7 862
      The Endangered Species Act of 1973 863
      *Tennessee Valley Authority v. Hill* 866
      *National Association of Home Builders v. Defenders of Wildlife* 875
      *Sierra Club v. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service* 882
      Discussion Problem: The Canada Lynx and National Forest Management 884
   3. The Take Prohibition of Section 9 887
      The Endangered Species Act of 1973 888
      *Babbitt v. Sweet Home Chapter of Communities for a Great Oregon* 891
D. Current Species Protection in Place 899
   *WildEarth Guardians v. U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service* 899
E. Discussion Problem: Climate Change, Polar Bears, and the Endangered Species Act 905

CHAPTER FOURTEEN

WATER 909

A. Overview 910
B. Discussion Problem: Creating a Water Law System 913
C. State Law 914
   1. The Riparian Doctrine 914
Contents

**Hoover v. Crane**  
The Restatement (Second) of Torts  
Charting the Course of Riparianism: An Instrumentalist Theory of Change  
2. The Prior Appropriation Doctrine  
**Irwin v. Phillips**  
**R.J.A., Inc. v. Water Users Association**  
**Thornton v. Fort Collins**  
3. Regulated Riparianism  
**Village of Tequesta v. Jupiter Inlet Corp.**  
**Southwest Florida Water Management District v. Charlotte County**  
The Regulated Riparian Model Water Code  
4. Groundwater  
**Wisconsin v. Michels Pipeline Construction, Inc.**  
Water Follies: Groundwater Pumping and the Fate of America’s Fresh Waters  
Discussion Problem: Comparing Groundwater Doctrines  
D. The Federal Overlay  
1. Federal Reserved Water Rights  
**Winters v. United States**  
**United States v. New Mexico**  
2. The Dormant Commerce Clause  
**Sporhase v. Nebraska ex rel. Douglas**  
3. Federal Water Pollution Prevention and Control  
Clean Water Act of 1972  
**South Florida Water Management District v. Miccosukee Tribe of Indians**  
4. Federal Protection of Endangered Species  
**Natural Resources Defense Council v. Jewell**  
E. Discussion Problem: Climate Change and Water Resources  
Climate Impacts on Water Resources  

CHAPTER FIFTEEN  
WETLANDS  

A. Overview  
Wetland Functions and Values  
B. Which Waters Does Section 404 Regulate?  
Clean Water Act of 1972  
Army Corps of Engineers Wetlands Regulations  
United States v. Riverside Bayview Homes, Inc. 999
Solid Waste Agency of Northern Cook County v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers 1004
Rapanos v. United States 1010
Discussion Problem: The Great Salt Lake 1019

C. Which Activities Does Section 404 Regulate? 1022
Clean Water Act of 1972 1023
Army Corps of Engineers Wetlands Regulations (Tulloch III) 1023
Avoyelles Sportsmen’s League, Inc. v. Marsh 1025
National Mining Association v. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers 1030
Coeur Alaska, Inc. v. Southeast Alaska Conservation Council 1035

D. The Section 404 Permit Process 1041
Clean Water Act of 1972 1042
Environmental Protection Agency 404(B)(1) Guidelines 1043
Army Corps of Engineers Wetlands Regulations 1044
Army Corps of Engineers Reissuance of Nationwide Permits 1044
National Wildlife Federation v. Whistler 1045
Fund for Animals, Inc. v. Rice 1048

E. Discussion Problem: Removing Mountaintops, Filling Valleys 1052

CHAPTER SIXTEEN
NATURAL RESOURCES AND REGULATORY takings 1057

A. Overview 1058

B. A Brief Review of Regulatory Takings 1059
1. The Ad Hoc Factual Approach 1059
   Penn Central Transportation Co. v. New York 1059
2. The Categorical Approach 1063
   Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council 1063
3. Refining the Analysis 1071
   Tahoe-Sierra Preservation Council, Inc. v. Tahoe Regional Planning Agency 1072
   Murr v. Wisconsin 1077
   Givings 1084

C. Private Property Interests in Natural Resources 1087
1. The Antecedent Inquiry: Identifying the Property Interest 1088
   Conti v. United States 1088
2. Property Interests in Wetlands 1092
   Palazzolo v. Rhode Island 1092
CHAPTER SEVENTEEN

WILDLAND FIRE: BRINGING IT ALL TOGETHER

A. Overview
B. Discussion Problem: The New Fire Dilemma
C. Government Liability for Fire Management
   State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. v. United States
D. Public Land Management and the Threat of Fire
   Rounds v. U.S. Forest Service
E. Legislative Responses to the Fire Dilemma
   The Healthy Forests Restoration Act of 2003
   Decker v. U.S. Forest Service
   Biodiversity Associates v. Cables
   2002 Supplemental Appropriations Act for Further Recovery from and Response to Terrorist Acts

Table of Cases
Table of Statutes
Index