CONTENTS

Preface xxv
Acknowledgments xxvii
Special Notice xxix

INTRODUCTION 1

A. The Career of a Criminal Case 1
   1. Procedure Before Trial 2
      Donald Dripps, Criminal Justice Process 2
   2. Substantive Legal Issues Before Trial 5
   3. Procedure at Trial 7
   4. Substantive Legal Issues on Appeal 8
B. Sources of Criminal Law 9
   1. Statutes 9
   2. Precedent 10
   3. Constitutions 12
C. The Analysis of Criminal Liability 14
   1. The Purpose of Analysis 14
   2. The Model Penal Code Scheme 15
   3. The German Scheme 16
D. Burdens of Proof and Due Process 16

I

JUST PUNISHMENT 21

New York Penal Law 27
## The Purposes and Limits of Punishment

**A. An Introductory Problem**

Notes and Questions

**B. Utilitarianism and Retributivism**

John Braithwaite & Philip Pettit, *Not Just Deserts: A Republican Theory of Criminal Justice*

**C. Utilitarian Punishment**

1. The Utility Principle as a Limit on Punishment
   - Jeremy Bentham, *The Theory of Legislation*

2. Deterrence
   - Jeremy Bentham, *The Theory of Legislation*
   - James Q. Wilson, *Thinking About Crime*
   - Anthony N. Doob & Cheryl Marie Webster, *Sentence Severity and Crime: Accepting the Null Hypothesis*
   - Louis Seidman, *Soldiers, Martyrs, and Criminal Law: Utilitarianism and the Problem of Crime Control*
   - Randolph Roth, *American Homicide*

3. Rehabilitation
   - David Rothman, *The Discovery of the Asylum*
   - Edward L. Rubin, *The Inevitability of Rehabilitation*
   - Francis A. Allen, *Criminal Justice, Legal Values, and the Rehabilitative Ideal*
   - Elliot Currie, *Confronting Crime: An American Challenge*
   - Michael Tonry, *Malign Neglect: Race, Crime, and Punishment in America*

4. Incapacitation
   - James Q. Wilson, *Thinking About Crime*
   - Alfred Blumstein & Jacqueline Cohen, *Characterizing Criminal Careers*
   - Markus Dirk Dubber, *Recidivist Statutes as Arational Punishment*

**D. Retribution**

1. Retribution as a Limit on Punishment
   - H.J. McCloskey, *A Non-Utilitarian Approach to Punishment*
   - John Rawls, *Two Concepts of Rules*
   - Guyora Binder & Nicholas J. Smith, *Framed: Utilitarianism and Punishment of the Innocent*
   - Herbert Packer, *The Limits of the Criminal Sanction*
   - Alan H. Goldman, *The Paradox of Punishment*
   - David Dolinko, *Three Mistakes of Retributivism*
   - Michael L. Corrado, *The Abolition of Punishment*

*Kansas v. Hendricks*
Notes and Questions 65

2. Retribution as an Affirmative Justification for Punishment 66
   a. The Appeal to Intuition 66
      Michael Moore, Law and Psychiatry 66
      Notes and Questions 67
   b. The Argument from Social Contract 67
      Herbert Morris, On Guilt and Innocence 67
      Jeffrie Murphy, Marxism and Retribution 68
      Notes and Questions 69
   c. The Expressive Argument 70
      Joel Feinberg, Doing and Deserving 70
      Jean Hampton, Punishment as Defeat 71
      Notes and Questions 72

E. Beyond Utility and Desert: Educative Theories of Punishment 72
   Herbert Morris, A Paternalistic Theory of Punishment 73
   R.A. Duff, Trials and Punishments 74
   John Braithwaite, Crime, Shame, and Reintegration 75
   Notes and Questions 76

F. Proportionality 76
   Graham v. Florida 76
   Notes and Questions 82
   Kennedy v. Louisiana 85
   Notes and Questions 88
   Ewing v. California 88
   Notes and Questions 91
   Miller v. Alabama 93
   Notes and Questions 95

G. Modern Guidelines Sentencing 97
   Kevin Reitz, Sentencing: Guidelines 99
   1. Due Process, the Jury, and Sentencing Designs 101
      Apprendi v. New Jersey 103
      Notes and Questions 105
   2. The Blakely-Booker Revolution in Sentencing 106
      Notes and Questions 110

II

THE ELEMENTS OF THE CRIMINAL OFFENSE 115

2

THE CRIMINAL ACT 117

A. The Need for an Actus Reus 119
   Proctor v. State 119
   Notes and Questions 122
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. Omissions</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Jones v. United States</em></td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Possession</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>United States v. Maldonado</em></td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>State v. Barger</em></td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Requirement of Harm</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lawrence v. Texas</em></td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. The Requirement of Voluntariness</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>People v. Newton</em></td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Martin v. State</em></td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>People v. Grant</em></td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. The Prohibition of “Status” Crimes</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Robinson v. California</em></td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Johnson v. State</em></td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Legality</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Keeler v. Superior Court</em></td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>United States v. Hudson and Goodwin</em></td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Rogers v. Tennessee</em></td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Specificity</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chicago v. Morales</em></td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE GUILTY MIND</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Requirement of a Guilty Mind</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>People v. Dillard</em></td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>United States v. Wulff</em></td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lambert v. California</em></td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Categories of Culpability</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Regina v. Faulkner</em></td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Model Penal Code §§1.13 and 2.02
Notes and Questions

C. Mistake and Mens Rea Default Rules
Regina v. Prince
Notes and Questions
People v. Ryan
Notes and Questions
Elonis v. United States
Notes and Questions

D. “Mistake of Law”
1. Introduction to Mistake of Law
2. Mistake of Law and Mens Rea
   People v. Bray
   Notes and Questions
   United States v. Baker
   Notes and Questions
   Cheek v. United States
   Notes and Questions
3. Mistake of Law as an Excuse
   Commonwealth v. Twitchell
   Notes and Questions

E. Capacity for Mens Rea
Hendershott v. People
Notes and Questions
State v. Cameron
Notes and Questions
Montana v. Egelhoff
Notes and Questions

CAUSATION

A. “But-For” Causation
Regina v. Martin Dyos
Notes and Questions
R. v. Benge
Notes and Questions

B. Violent Acts
Hubbard v. Commonwealth
Notes and Questions

C. Proximate Cause: Foreseeability and Related Limitations
Commonwealth v. Rhoades
Notes and Questions

D. Intervening Causes
Commonwealth v. Root
Notes and Questions
United States v. Hamilton
Notes and Questions 319

Stephenson v. State 322
Notes and Questions 324
People v. Kevorkian 326
Notes and Questions 330

E. Causation by Omission: Duties 331
Commonwealth v. Levesque 332
Notes and Questions 334

III

HOMICIDE OFFENSES 341

Ala. Code §§13A-6-2 through 13A-6-4 344
Cal. Penal Code §§187 through 189, 191.5 through 192 345
Minnesota Statutes Ann. 609.185 350
Model Penal Code §§210.2 through 210.4 351
New York Penal Code §§125.10, 125.12, 125.15, 125.20, 125.25, 125.27 352

5

INTENTIONAL HOMICIDE 359

A. Intentional Murder (Second Degree) 359
Francis v. Franklin 359
Notes and Questions 362
B. Premeditated Murder (First Degree) 365
United States v. Watson 365
Notes and Questions 369
C. Voluntary Manslaughter 380
1. The Theory of Mitigation 380
People v. Walker 380
Notes and Questions 382
2. “Cooling Time” 387
Ex Parte Fraley 387
Notes and Questions 388
3. Adultery as “Adequate Provocation” 391
Rowland v. State 391
Notes and Questions 393
4. Provocation Under Reform Rules 399
People v. Berry 399
Notes and Questions 402
5. Cultural Norms and the Reasonable Person 408
   People v. Wu 408
   Notes and Questions 417

6. UNINTENTIONAL HOMICIDE 423

   A. Involuntary Manslaughter 423
      1. Negligent and Reckless Homicide 423
         Commonwealth v. Welansky 423
         Notes and Questions 427
      2. Involuntary Manslaughter in Contemporary Settings 430
         State v. Williams 430
         Notes and Questions 433
   B. Reckless Murder 438
      Mayes v. The People 438
      Notes and Questions 440
   C. Homicide in the Course of Another Crime 450
      1. Felony Murder: An Introduction 450
         State v. Martin 450
         Notes and Questions 455
      2. Causal Limitations 464
         People v. Washington 464
         Notes and Questions 469
         People v. Hickman 470
         Notes and Questions 472
         People v. Gladman 477
         Notes and Questions 479
         People v. Cavitt 481
         Notes and Questions 484
      3. Dangerous Felony Limitations 484
      4. The Independent Felonious Purpose Limitation 488
         State v. Shock 488
         Notes and Questions 491
      5. Two Variants of Felony Murder 495
         a. Misdemeanor Manslaughter 495
         b. Death-Aggravated Felonies 497

7. CAPITAL MURDER AND THE DEATH PENALTY 501

   A. A Historical and Constitutional Summary 501
   B. The New Capital Statutes 509
      1. The Structure of “Guided Discretion”: An Exemplary Case 510
         Olsen v. State 510
Notes and Questions

2. Mitigating Circumstances

3. Weighing the Circumstances

C. Categorical Limits on the Death Penalty

1. The Mens Rea Limit: A Reprise on Felony Murder
   *Tison v. Arizona*
   Notes and Questions

2. Victim/Race Discrimination and the Eighth Amendment
   *McCleskey v. Kemp*
   Notes and Questions

IV

JUSTIFICATION AND EXCUSE

A. Distinguishing Justification and Excuse

B. Justification, Excuse, and the Purposes of Punishment

C. Combining Justification and Excuse

8

DEFENSIVE FORCE, NECESSITY, AND DURESS

A. Defensive Force

1. Elements and Rationales
   *People v. La Voie*
   Notes and Questions
   *People v. Gleghorn*
   Notes and Questions

2. The Reasonable Self-Defender: The Case of the Battered Spouse
   *State v. Leidholm*
   Notes and Questions

3. Reprise on the Reasonable Self-Defender
   *People v. Goetz*
   Notes and Questions

4. Defensive Force and Law Enforcement
   *Tennessee v. Garner*
   Notes and Questions
   *People v. Ceballos*
   Notes and Questions

B. Choice of Evils — Necessity

1. The Moral Issue
   *The Queen v. Dudley & Stephens*
   Notes and Questions

2. Escape from Intolerable Prison Conditions
   *People v. Unger*
### Contents

105

**MENTAL ILLNESS AS A DEFENSE** 647

A. Introduction 647

B. The *M'Naghten* Rule and Cognition 649
   *People v. Serravo* 649
   Notes and Questions 659

C. Cognition and Volition: The Road from *M'Naghten* and Back 666
   *Smith v. State* 670
   Notes and Questions 674

D. Reprise: Reassessing the Insanity Defense 683

E. “Quasi-Insanity” Defenses 687
   1. Alcohol and Other Drugs 687
   2. Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder 692
   3. Postpartum Psychosis 696
   4. “Multiple Personality” Disorder 697
   5. The Antisocial Personality 699

### V

**ATTRIBUTION OF CRIMINALITY** 703

10

**ATTEMPT** 705

A. The Punishment for Attempt 705
   1. Why Punish Attempt? 705
   2. The Emergence of Attempt Liability 706
      *George Fletcher, Rethinking Criminal Law* 706
   3. The Grading of Attempt 707
      *Model Penal Code §5.05* 707

B. The Mens Rea for Attempt 709
   *State v. Lyerla* 709
   Notes and Questions 712
   *People v. Bland* 716
Notes and Questions 722

C. The Actus Reus of Attempt 723
1. Preparation vs. Attempt
   People v. Murray 723
   Notes and Questions 723
   McQuirter v. State 726
   Notes and Questions 728
   People v. Rizzo 728
   Notes and Questions 731
2. Abandonment 735
   People v. Staples 735
   Notes and Questions 737
3. Solicitation 740
   People v. Lubow 740
   Notes and Questions 742

D. Impossibility 745
   Booth v. State 745
   Notes and Questions 751
   People v. Dlugash 757
   Notes and Questions 760
   People v. Thousand 761
   Notes and Questions 764

11

COMPLICITY 769

A. The Accessorial Act 772
   State v. Ochoa 772
   Notes and Questions 777
   State v. Tally 785
   Notes and Questions 793
   State v. Formella 797
   Notes and Questions 800
B. Mens Rea of Complicity 800
   1. Intent to Aid or Encourage 802
      People v. Beeman 802
      Notes and Questions 806
   2. The Mental Element of the Offense 810
      Wilson v. People 810
      Notes and Questions 812
   3. Combined Standards and Unintended Harm 813
      State v. Etzweiler 814
      Notes and Questions 815
   4. Culpability for Secondary Crimes 819
      Rosemond v. United States 819
      Notes and Questions 823
      People v. Kessler 824
      Notes and Questions 826
C. Relations of Parties 827
   1. The Perpetrator Is Excused 828
   2. The Perpetrator Is Justified 829
   3. The Perpetrator Lacks Mens Rea 829
   4. Discrepant Mens Rea 831
   5. One of the Parties Lacks a Required Status for the Crime 832
D. Criminal Liability of Corporations 839
   1. Respondeat Superior and the Premises of Corporate Liability 839
      State v. Christy Pontiac-GMC, Inc. 839
      Notes and Questions 841
      United States v. Hilton Hotels Corp. 846
      Notes and Questions 847
   2. The MPC and the “Corporate Mind” 848
      Notes and Questions 849

CONSPIRACY 853

A. The Nature of Conspiracy 854
   State v. Verive 854
   Notes and Questions 856
B. The Agreement 862
   1. Proof of Formation 862
      Griffin v. State 862
      Notes and Questions 863
   2. Termination of the Agreement 868
      United States v. Recio 868
      Notes and Questions 870
C. The Mens Rea of Conspiracy 872
   People v. Lauria 872
   Notes and Questions 878
D. Special Mens Rea Problems of Conspiracy 882
E. The Incidents of Conspiracy 885
   United States v. Diaz 885
   Notes and Questions 887
F. The Parties to and Objects of Conspiracy 891
   1. Bilateral and Unilateral Conspiracies 891
   2. The Scope of the Conspiracy 895
      a. Single vs. Multiple Conspiracies 895
      b. Chains, Wheels, Etc. 897
         United States v. Caldwell 901
         Notes and Questions 903
G. The RICO Statute and the Frontier of Conspiracy 904
   1. The Statute 904
   2. Elements of Racketeering 906
   3. RICO Conspiracies 909
      United States v. Neapolitan 909
      Notes and Questions 912
VI

ADDITIONAL OFFENSES

13

RAPE

A. Introduction
   1. Defining Rape
   2. Some Facts About Rape in the United States
   3. The Evolution of Rape Rules
B. The Requirement of “Utmost Resistance”
   Brown v. State
   Notes and Questions
C. “Reasonable” or “Earnest” Resistance
   People v. Dorsey
   Notes and Questions
D. Force
   People v. Barnes
   Notes and Questions
E. Nonconsent
   State v. Smith
   Notes and Questions
F. Lack of Affirmative Expression of Consent
   In the Interest of M.T.S.
   Notes and Questions
G. Incapacity to Consent
   State v. Moorman
   Notes and Questions
H. Rape by Extortion
   Commonwealth v. Mlinarich
   Notes and Questions
I. Rape by Fraud
   Boro v. People
   Notes and Questions
J. Mens Rea
   Commonwealth v. Fischer
   Notes and Questions
K. Evidentiary Reforms

14

THEFT OFFENSES

A. Theft
   1. The Meaning of Theft
      Commonwealth v. Mitchneck
      Notes and Questions
2. The Development of Theft Offenses

   The Case of the Carrier Who Broke Bulk Anon v. the Sheriff of London 1008
   Rex v. Chisser 1009
   The King v. Pear 1009
   Notes and Questions 1010

B. Fraud

   1. False Pretenses
      People v. Satllekau 1017
      Notes and Questions 1021
   2. Scheme to Defraud in Federal Law
      Durland v. United States 1021
      Notes and Questions 1024
   3. Bank Fraud
      United States v. Phillips 1031
      Notes and Questions 1036

C. Extortion

   People v. Dioguardi 1039
   Notes and Questions 1043
   McCormick v. United States 1048
   Notes and Questions 1051

D. Robbery

   Lear v. State 1054
   Notes and Questions 1055

E. Burglary

   State v. Colvin 1059
   Notes and Questions 1061

15

PERJURY, FALSE STATEMENTS, AND OBSTRUCTION OF JUSTICE 1071

A. Perjury

   Bronston v. United States 1071
   Notes and Questions 1076
   Stuart Green, Lying, Misleading, and Falsely Denying: How Moral Concepts Inform the Law of Perjury, Fraud, and False Statements 1082
   Notes and Questions 1087

B. False Statements

   United States v. Moore 1087
   Notes and Questions 1090
   Brogan v. United States 1091
   Notes and Questions 1093

C. Obstruction of Justice

   1. The Omnibus Provision — §1503 1094
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix A</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A NOTE ON THE MODEL PENAL CODE</td>
<td>1125</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

McClain and Dan Kahan, Criminal Law Reform: Historical Development in the United States | 1125 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix B</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THE MODEL PENAL CODE</td>
<td>1129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Table of Cases | 1181 |
| Table of Model Penal Code Sections | 1191 |
| Index | 1193 |