Contents

Preface xix
Acknowledgments xxi

Introduction
The Context of the Religion Clauses 1
A. The Constitutional Context 1
B. The Religion Clauses in Context 3

Part I
WHAT IS RELIGION?

Chapter 1 11
Malnak v. Yogi
The New Age and the New Law
A. Transcendental Meditation and the New Age 12
B. TM’s Opponents Go to Law 13
C. The Trial 16
D. The New Definition 17
E. The New Definition Applied and Critiqued 21
F. The New New Religions 24

Chapter 2 33
United States v. Ballard
Government Prohibited from Declaring Religious Truth
A. History of the I AM Movement 33
B. Theological Influences on I AM 35
C. The Proceedings Against the Ballards 38
E. The Aftermath 43
F. The Implications of the Case 43
Part II

FREE EXERCISE

Chapter 3

Wisconsin v. Yoder

An Anthropologist Shapes a Supreme Court Decision

A. Introduction 53
B. Social Issues and Social Upheaval in 1972 54
C. The History of Amish Persecution 56
D. The Beginnings of the Case 57
E. The Life of the Amish 61
F. The Oral Argument and Decision of the Supreme Court 65
G. The Decision Over Time 68

Chapter 4

Goldman v. Weinberger

Religious Freedom Confronts Military Uniformity

A. The Facts 72
   1. The Official Story 72
   2. Goldman’s Story 73
      a. Goldman’s Prior Military Service 73
      b. The Origins of the Dispute 74
      c. The Air Force’s Conduct 75
   B. The Litigation 76
      1. The Official Story 76
         a. The District Court 76
         b. The Court of Appeals 77
         c. The Supreme Court 78
      2. The Unofficial Story 80
         a. Perspectives of Judge Robinson and Judge Starr 80
         b. The Government’s Strategy 80
   C. Looking Back at the Case — Questions That Remain 81

Chapter 5

Bob Jones University v. United States

A Journey Through Scripture and History

A. Introduction 85
B. History of the Schools and Their Policies 86
   1. History and Operation of Goldsboro Christian Schools 86
      a. In General 86
      b. The GCS Admissions Policy: Based on Race 87
   2. History and Operation of Bob Jones University 87
      a. In General 87
      b. The BJU Admissions Policy: Based on Conduct but Cognizant of Race 89
C. The Procedural Posture of the Case 90
D. The Substantive Legal Significance of the Case 92
E. Analyzing the Case in Context: The Theological and Cultural Factors That Drove the Controversies

1. The Theological Context of the Case: The Purportedly Biblical Basis of GCS and BJU for Opposing Interracial Marriage
2. An Alternative View of What the Bible Really Teaches on Matters of Race and Nations
3. The Broader Cultural Context of the Case: Southern Fundamentalism in Twentieth Century America

F. Epilogue

Chapter 6

Employment Division, Department of Human Resources of Oregon v. Smith

The Battle for Religious Freedom

A. Introduction
B. Al Smith
C. An Appeal for Unemployment Benefits
D. The Challenge in State Court
E. The United States Supreme Court
F. The Congressional Response

Chapter 7

Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye, Inc. v. City of Hialeah

The Protection of Majority Religions’ Privilege at the Nexus of Race, Class, and Ethnicity

A. Why This Case Is Important: Then and Now
B. From Church to Court — A Narrative of the Dispute
   1. Pichardo Versus the City — Round 1
   2. Pichardo Versus the City — Round 2
C. Religion Beyond Narrative: The History of the Santería Religion
D. Beyond Narrative and History: The Faces of Assimilation and Religion
   1. The Plaintiffs: Ernesto Pichardo and the Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye
      a. Ernesto Pichardo
      b. The Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye
   2. The Defendants
      a. The City of Hialeah
      b. The Mayor of Hialeah
      c. The Hialeah City Council
E. Rules of Law That Emerged from the Case
F. Aftermath
Part III

ESTABLISHMENT

Chapter 8

Lemon v. Kurtzman

The Parochial School Crisis and the Establishment Clause

A. Introduction
B. Background
   1. The School-Aid Question
   2. Establishment Clause Precedents
   3. The Catholic School Crisis
C. Legislation and Litigation
   1. Pennsylvania
   2. Rhode Island
   3. The Parties and Lawyers
   4. The Pennsylvania Case (Lemon): Religion and Race
   5. The Rhode Island Case
   6. The Colleges Case (Tilton)
D. The Cases in the Supreme Court
   1. Briefing and Oral Argument
   2. Deciding and Opinion Drafting
E. The Supreme Court’s Opinions
   1. Lemon
   2. Tilton
   3. The Racial Segregation Issue
F. Lemon’s Regime
   1. School Funding Cases
   2. Establishment Clause Cases Generally
G. Lemon’s (Partial) Decline
   1. Funding Cases
   2. The Establishment Clause Generally

Chapter 9

Lynch v. Donnelly and Allegheny County v. ACLU

“Christ Is Not a Turkey”

A. The Crèche in the Context of Other Christmas Symbols
   1. Lynch v. Donnelly
      a. The Lower Court Decisions
      b. The Arguments in Favor of the Crèche Display
      c. The Arguments Against the Crèche Display
      d. The Oral Argument
      e. The Justices’ Deliberations and Opinions
   2. Application of Lynch in the Courthouse Context: County of Allegheny v. ACLU
      a. The Lower Court Decisions
      b. The Arguments at the Supreme Court in Favor of the Crèche Display
c. The Arguments at the Supreme Court Against the Crèche Display 189
d. The Oral Argument 190
e. Distinguish or Follow Lynch? — The Justices’ Deliberations and Opinions 192
B. Discussion and Analysis of the Crèche Cases 195

Chapter 10
Board of Education of Kiryas Joel Village School District v. Grumet
A Religious Group’s Quest for Its Own Public School

A. Introduction: The Creation of Kiryas Joel 203
B. The Issue: Is Creating a Public School District in/for a Religiously Homogeneous Community a Violation of the Establishment Clause? 204
C. The Facts: The History of the Satmars and Kiryas Joel 205
D. The Parties, the Lawyers, and the Lawsuit 210
E. The Arguments 212
F. The Court’s Decision: The Holding and Its Ambiguities 214
G. Issues, Resolved and Unresolved 215
1. Neutrality: Intent vs. Effects and Non-Preferred Standard 215
2. Neutrality and Accommodation 215
3. Neutrality and Delegation (the “Fusion” Theory) 216
5. Religious Gerrymandering: Justice Souter’s Confusion and Justice Kennedy’s Concurrence 219
6. The Tension Between Neutrality as Equal Opportunity Separatism (Accommodation) and the Anti-Gerrymandering and Anti-Line-Drawing Principles 222
7. Anti-Separatism: Justice Steven’s Concurrence 222
H. Conclusion: Contradictions and Confusions and the Aftermath of Grumet 224

Chapter 11
Edwards v. Aguillard
Evolution and Creation in the Legal Crucible

A. The American Saga of Darwin Versus the Bible 232
B. The Early Legal Clashes 233
C. The Origins of Creation-Science 234
D. The Arkansas Statute and Trial 237
E. The Louisiana Statute in the Lower Courts 238
F. The Professors and the Scientists in the Supreme Court 239
G. The Main Briefs in the Supreme Court 240
H. Oral Argument 242
I. The Conference 243
J. The Opinion for the Court 244
K. The Aftermath 246
Chapter 12

Rosenberger v. Rector and Visitors of the University of Virginia

The Triumph of the Neutrality Principle

A. The Background to Rosenberger
B. In the Lower Courts
C. Before the U.S. Supreme Court
D. The Supreme Court’s Decision
E. The Impact of the Rosenberger Decision

Part IV

ACCOMMODATION AND TOLERANCE

Chapter 13

Presiding Bishop of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints v. Amos

Addressing Tensions Between the Free Exercise and Establishment Clauses

A. Frank Mayson and the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints
B. Religious Discrimination
C. Bringing Suit
   1. Beehive Clothing Mills
   2. Deseret Industries
   3. The Lawyers
D. Amos in the Federal District Court
E. At the Supreme Court

Chapter 14

Freeman v. Dep’t of Highway Safety & Motor Vehicles and Webb v. City of Philadelphia

Accommodation Tangles in the Laws Over Hair

A. Introduction
B. Rethinking Concepts Relevant to the Debate
   1. Accommodation and Tolerance
   2. Rethinking Hair and the Cloth That Covers It
C. The Cases
   1. The Freeman Case
   2. Webb v. City of Philadelphia
D. Remaining Legal Tangles

Index