**CONTENTS**

Preface ................................................................. xxxi
Acknowledgments ............................................... xxxv
Abbreviations Index ............................................ xli
Introduction ......................................................... xliii

**PART I. FRAMEWORKS** ........................................... 1

**1 FORMATIVE TENSIONS IN THE HISTORY OF RELIGIOUS FREEDOM** ............................................. 3

I. INTRODUCTION .................................................... 3

II. THE LEGACY OF PERSECUTION .............................. 4

   A. From Persecuted to Persecutor .......................... 4
   B. Punishment of Heresy ...................................... 7
      • An Early Heresy Trial: The Case of John Hus ....... 8
   C. Church-State Tensions .................................... 10

III. THE EMERGENCE OF TOLERATION:

       THE ENGLISH EXPERIENCE ............................. 11

   A. Historical Development of Religious Tolerance in England ........................................ 11
   B. John Locke: A Letter Concerning Toleration ....... 13

IV. THE EMERGENCE OF RELIGIOUS LIBERTY RIGHTS: COMPETING APPROACHES ......................... 18

   A. Separation for the Sake of Religion .................. 19
2 THEORETICAL AND RELIGIOUS PERSPECTIVES ON FREEDOM OF RELIGION

I. INTRODUCTION

II. DEFINING RELIGION

A. General Aspects of the Definition Problem
1. Problems of Over- and Under-inclusive Definitions
2. Differentiating the Religious from the Non-religious
3. Nature of the Definition of Religion Problem
4. Philosophical Conflicts Underlying Definitions of Religion

B. Approaches That Define Religion from a Standpoint Extrinsic to Religious Communities
1. Essentialist Definitions
2. Functionalist Definitions
3. Analogical Definitions
   - The Church of the New Faith and the Commissioner of Pay-roll Tax, High Court of Australia (1983)
C. Deferential Approaches to Defining Religion 53
D. Islam and the Definition of Religion 55

III. GENERAL JUSTIFICATIONS FOR FREEDOM OF RELIGION AND BELIEF 56
A. Classic Arguments for Religious Freedom 56
   1. Early American Arguments 56
      • James Madison, Memorial and Remonstrance Against Religious Assessments (1785) 57
   2. Contemporary Empirical Justification 61
      • Brian J. Grim, Religious Freedom: Good for What Ails Us? 61
B. Natural Law, Natural Rights and Religious Freedom 63
C. Human Dignity 65

IV. RELIGIOUS ARGUMENTS FOR FREEDOM, TOLERANCE, AND MUTUAL RESPECT 67

V. THE VALUE OF MULTIPLE JUSTIFICATIONS 70
A. Overlapping Consensus 71
B. Overlapping Justification 72
C. Incompletely Theorized Agreements 74

3 INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS PERSPECTIVES ON FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF 77

I. INTRODUCTION 77

II. THE EVOLUTION OF INTERNATIONAL PROTECTION OF FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF 78

III. FREEDOM OF RELIGION AND THE UNIVERSAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS 79

IV. THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANTS 82
A. The International Covenant of Civil and Political Rights and the Optional Protocol 83
B. The 1981 Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief 84
V. UN MONITORING INSTITUTIONS 86
   A. The Role and Significance of the UN Commission on Human Rights and the UN Human Rights Council 86
   B. The UN Human Rights Committee 87
      • Raihon Hudoyberganova v. Uzbekistan, UN Human Rights Committee (2004) 88
      • Note on the Role of Nongovernmental Organizations in Promoting Freedom of Religion and Belief 90

VI. REGIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS REGIMES 91
   A. The Council of Europe Institutions 91
   B. The European Court of Human Rights 92
      1. Procedure During the Commission Era 92
      3. Admissibility 95
      4. Standing 95
         • Key Provisions of the European Convention on Freedom of Religion or Belief 97
         • Arrowsmith v. United Kingdom, European Commission of Human Rights (1978) 98
         • Leyla Sahin v. Turkey, European Court of Human Rights (2005) 100
         • Update on the Headscarf Ban 104
   C. The European Union 105
      2. Declaration on the Status of Churches and Non-confessional Organizations (1997) 106
   D. The Organization (formerly Conference) on Security and Co-operation in Europe 106
      • Urban Gibson and Karen S. Lord, Advancements in Standard Setting: Religious Liberty and OSCE Commitments 107
   E. Organization of Islamic Conference 108
      • The Cairo Declaration on Human Rights in Islam (1990) 108

VII. THE IMPLEMENTATION OF INTERNATIONAL NORMS IN NATIONAL LEGAL SYSTEMS 110
COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVES ON RELIGION-STATE RELATIONSHIPS

I. INTRODUCTION

II. THE RANGE OF POSSIBLE RELIGION-STATE STRUCTURES
   A. A Comparative Framework for Conceptualizing Religion-State Relationships
   B. The Range of Institutional Religion-State Relationships

III. POSITIVE IDENTIFICATION REGIMES
   A. The Spanish Experience
   B. German Experience: Issues Surrounding “Church Tax”
   C. Provisions of the 2005 Iraqi Constitution

IV. NON-IDENTIFICATION: THE TENSION BETWEEN ACCOMMODATION AND SEPARATION
   A. The Accommodation/Separation Debate in the United States
   B. The Australian Approach
   C. Varieties of Separation: Benign Neutrality or Hostility Toward Religion
      1. The Three-Prong Test of Lemon v. Kurtzman
      2. History and Tradition
      3. Endorsement
PART II. FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF

5 FREEDOM OF RELIGIOUS BELIEF AND EXPRESSION

I. INTRODUCTION

II. PROTECTION OF THE CORE DOMAIN OF CONSCIENCE: RELIGIOUS BELIEF AND THE INTERNAL FORUM

A. Compelled Patriotic Observances in the United States

B. Europe

III. RELIGIOUS SPEECH

A. Religious Persuasion

B. Anti-Conversion Laws

xviii Contents
• Afghani Case Involving Conversion from Islam to Christianity 182

IV. CONFLICTS BETWEEN FREEDOM OF RELIGION AND FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION 183

A. Religiously Motivated Speech that Offends 184
• Religiously Motivated Speech Condemning Homosexuality 184
• The Pastor Green Case, Supreme Court of Sweden (2005) 184
• Note on Hate Speech Legislation in the United States—Brandenburg v. Ohio, Supreme Court of the United States (1969) 187
• Note on University Hate Speech Codes 188
• Note on the Hate Speech Paradox 189

B. Speech that Offends Religious Sensitivities 190
• Joseph Burstyn, Inc. v. Wilson, Supreme Court of the United States (1952) 190
• Otto-Preminger-Institut v. Austria, European Court of Human Rights (1994) 192
• The United Kingdom’s Racial and Religious Hatred Act 2006 197
• The Danish Islamic Cartoon Controversy 198
• Report of Special Rapporteurs on Incitement to Racial and Religious Hatred and the Promotion of Intolerance (2006) 200

V. IS THE RIGHT TO FREEDOM OF RELIGION OR BELIEF REDUNDANT? 202

6 LIMITATIONS ON RELIGIOUS ACTIONS AND MANIFESTATIONS 205

I. INTRODUCTION 205

II. THE UNITED STATES 206

A. The Nineteenth-Century Background 206

B. The Emergence of the Compelling State Interest Test 209
• Sherbert v. Verner, Supreme Court of the United States (1963) 210
• Wisconsin v. Yoder, Supreme Court of the United States (1972) 214

C. The Partial Abandonment of the Compelling State Interest Test 218
• Employment Division, Department of Human Resources of Oregon v. Smith, Supreme Court of the United States (1990) 218
D. The Resilience of the Compelling State Interest Test


2. The Supreme Court’s Response to RFRA: The Unconstitutionality of RFRA as Applied to the States
   • City of Boerne v. P.F. Flores, Archbishop of San Antonio, Supreme Court of the United States (1997)
   • Note on the Status of “Federal” RFRA: Gonzales v. O Centro Espirita Beneficente Uniao Do Vegetal, Supreme Court of the United States (2006)

3. The Resilience of Free Exercise: Developments Since Boerne

III. THE EUROPEAN (AND INTERNATIONAL) APPROACH TO LIMITATIONS

A. Interference with Freedom of Religion or Belief
   • Jewish Liturgical Association Cha’are Shalom Ve Tsedek v. France, European Court of Human Rights (2000)

B. Legitimating Aims: Does National Security Qualify?
   • Nolan and K v. Russia, European Court of Human Rights (2009)

C. Necessity and Proportionality
   1. Europe
   2. Canada
      • Multani v. Commission Scolaire Marguerite-Bourgeoys and Attorney General of Quebec, Supreme Court of Canada (2006)
   3. South Africa
      • Prince v. President, Cape Law Society, South Africa Constitutional Court (2002)

7 RELIGIOUS RIGHTS IN SPECIALIZED REGULATORY CONTEXTS

I. INTRODUCTION

II. LAND USE AND ZONING

A. Land Use Processes: Zoning, Permits, Compatibility of Uses
   1. The United States
      • Larkin v. Grendel’s Den, Inc., Supreme Court of the United States (1982)
### III. RELIGIOUS FREEDOM IN SPECIALIZED INSTITUTIONAL SETTINGS

#### A. Prisons and Government Supervision

1. The United States
   - O’Lone v. Estate of Shabazz, Supreme Court of the United States (1987) 283

2. Religious Freedom in Prisons in Other Systems
   - X v. Germany, European Commission of Human Rights (1966) 286

#### B. The Military

1. The United States
   - Goldman v. Weinberger, Supreme Court of the United States (1986) 287

2. Europe
   - Kalaç v. Turkey, European Court of Human Rights (1997) 289

3. Conscientious Objection and Alternative Military Service
   - Decision on Right to Alternative Service Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation (1999) 290

### 8 RESPONDING TO RELIGIOUS EXTREMISM

#### I. INTRODUCTION

- Eileen Barker, Why the Cults? New Religious Movements and Freedom of Religion or Belief 294
II. RELIGIOUSLY MOTIVATED TERRORISM 299
   A. Japan: Aum Shinrikyo 301
      • Bruce Hoffman, Inside Terrorism 301
      • The Tokyo High Court Decision in the Aum Shinrikyo Case (1996) 304
   B. Terrorism and Islam 306
      • Benazir Bhutto, Reconciliation: Islam, Democracy, and the West 307
      • Mary Habeck, Knowing the Enemy: Jihadist Ideology and the War on Terror 308
      • Khaled Abou El Fadl, The Great Theft: Wrestling Islam from the Extremists 311
      • Khaled Abou El Fadl, The Place of Tolerance in Islam 311

III. TARGETING “DANGEROUS” SECTS AND CULTS 314
   A. The United States 314
      • Experience with the (Old) Cult Awareness Network 314
      • Note on Ruby Ridge and the Branch Davidians 315
      • Albert K. Bates, What Really Happened at Waco? “Cult” or Set-up? 316
      • James D. Tabor and Eugene V. Gallagher, Why Waco? Cults and the Battle for Religious Freedom in America 317
   B. China and the Falun Gong 319
      • Anne S.Y. Cheung, In Search of a Theory of Cult and Freedom of Religion in China: The Case of Falun Gong 319
   C. Europe 322
      • Commentary on France and Belgium 322
      • Willy Fautré, The Sect Issue in France and in Belgium 323

9 RELIGIOUS CONFLICT AND TENSIONS BETWEEN RELIGIOUS FREEDOM AND OTHER RIGHTS 331
   I. INTRODUCTION 331
      • The Complementary Dimensions of Religious Freedom and Other Human Rights 331
      • Tensions between Religious Freedom and Other Rights 332
II. GENOCIDE 332

- The Bosnian Conflict 334

III. RELIGION IN CONFLICT WITH NONDISCRIMINATION NORMS 338

- Johan D. van der Vyver, The Relationship of Freedom of Religion or Belief Norms to Other Human Rights 338

IV. DISCRIMINATION AGAINST RACIAL MINORITIES 340

A. South Africa 340
- Religion and Apartheid 340

B. United States 342
- Note on Bob Jones University v. United States, Supreme Court of the United States (1983) 342

V. RELIGION AND GENDER 345

A. CEDAW 346
- Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (1979) 346
- Juliet Sheen, Burdens on the Right of Women to Assert FORB Rights 348
- Mary Ann Glendon, Women’s Unfinished Journey 349

B. Religion in Conflict with Women’s Rights 350

1. Divorce 350
- India 350
  Note on Mohammed Ahmed Khan v. Shah Bano Begum, Supreme Court of India (1985) 350
- Canada 352
  Note on Shari’a through Arbitration: Private Jurisdiction Foreclosed 352
- United Kingdom 354
  British Shari’a Councils 354

2. Female Circumcision 355
- Bahia G. Tahzib-Lie, The Freedom to Undergo Female Genital Mutilation vs. the Protection of Public Health 355

VI. DISCRIMINATION AGAINST SEXUAL MINORITIES: THE SAME-SEX MARRIAGE CONTROVERSY 358

- In re Marriage Cases, Supreme Court of California (2008) 359

VII. CONCLUSION 368
PART III. THE RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN RELIGIOUS INSTITUTIONS AND THE STATE 369

10 RELIGIOUS AUTONOMY 371

I. INTRODUCTION 371

II. DISPUTES REGARDING RELIGIOUS PROPERTY 374

A. The United States 374

1. Deference to Polity under Federal Common Law:
   Watson v. Jones, Supreme Court of the United States (1871) 374

2. Deference to Polity under the First Amendment:
   Kedroff v. St. Nicholas Cathedral, Supreme Court of the United States (1952) 376

3. Rejection of the “Departure from Doctrine” Test 377
   Presbyterian Church in the United States v. Mary Elizabeth Blue Hull Memorial Presbyterian Church, Supreme Court of the United States (1969) 377

4. The “Neutral Principles of Law” Test 379
   Jones v. Wolf, Supreme Court of the United States (1979) 379

B. Europe 382


III. RELIGIOUS AUTONOMY AND PERSONNEL ISSUES 389

A. Autonomy with Respect to Religious Officials 390

1. The United States 390

   Serbian Eastern Orthodox Diocese v. Milivojevich, Supreme Court of the United States (1976) 390

2. Europe 394


B. The Scope of Religious Autonomy in Other Employment Settings 399

1. The United States 399

   Corporation of the Presiding Bishop v. Amos, Supreme Court of the United States (1987) 399

   The Ministerial Exception from Anti-Discrimination Laws for Clergy and Analogous Personnel 402
IV. AUTONOMY IN OTHER RELIGIOUS SETTINGS 414

11 RIGHT TO ASSOCIATION AND LEGAL PERSONALITY 419

I. INTRODUCTION 419

II. THE RIGHT OF RELIGIOUS COMMUNITIES TO ACQUIRE LEGAL PERSONALITY 420

A. The United States 420

B. Europe 424

1. Legal Structures Available to Religious Communities in Europe 424

2. The Right of Religious Communities to Obtain Legal Entity Status under the European Convention 428

C. Germany 434

D. Russia 438

E. China 446

1. Historical Background 446

2. Registration Developments 447

• EEOC v. Catholic University of America, U.S. Court of Appeals (1996) 402

2. Germany 407

• German Religious Employment Cases, Federal Constitutional Court of Germany (1985) 407

• Shavit v. The Chevra Kadisha of Rishon Le Zion, Supreme Court of Israel (1999) 414
12 FINANCIAL RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN RELIGION AND STATE

I. INTRODUCTION

- European and American Approaches to State Financial Support for Religion

II. DIRECT STATE FINANCIAL AID TO CHURCHES

A. The United States

- The Establishment Clause Prohibition on Direct Aid to Churches

B. Europe

1. Religion and State Relationships in Europe
2. State Funding of an Established Church
3. Compelling Non-believers to Pay Church Taxes

- Kustannus Oy Vapaa Ajattelija AB and others v. Finland, European Commission on Human Rights (1996)

C. Germany

- Gerhard Robbers, The German Tax Collection System for Favored Churches

D. Italy

- Silvio Ferrari, The Financial Relationship of Church and State in Italy

E. Japan

- The Yasukuni Shrine Controversy
- Anzai v. Shiraishi, Supreme Court of Japan, Grand Bench (1997)

F. Turkey

- The Hybrid of Separation and Control in Religion-State Relations in Turkey

III. INDIRECT STATE AID TO CHURCHES

A. The United States

1. Qualifying for Tax-Exempt Status in the United States (IRS Code §501(c)(3))
2. Tax Exemptions and the Establishment Clause

- Walz v. Tax Commissioner, Supreme Court of the United States (1970)

3. Free Exercise Claims for Exemptions from Taxation

- United States v. Lee, Supreme Court of the United States (1982)
B. Europe

- Religionsgemeinschaft der Zeugen Jehovas v. Austria, European Court of Human Rights (2008)

IV. AID TO RELIGIOUSLY AFFILIATED SOCIAL SERVICE ORGANIZATIONS

- The Circuits U.S. Approach to State Funding of Religiously Affiliated Charitable Activities
- Charitable Choice and Faith-based Initiatives: Expanding Cooperation in a Separationist State

13 EDUCATION

I. INTRODUCTION

II. STATE AID TO RELIGIOUS SCHOOLS

A. The United States

1. The Early Accommodationist Interpretation
2. The “No Aid” Principles and the “No Religious Uses” Doctrine
3. Neutrality and the “Private Choice” Doctrine
   - Establishment Clause Does Not Bar Use of State Scholarship by Blind Student at Religious Institution Due to Presence of Private Choice
   - Publicly Funded Interpreters for the Deaf Students at Religious Schools Permissible
4. A Shift Toward Neutrality and Increased Accommodation
5. Educational Vouchers for Parochial Education
   - Zelman v. Simmons-Harris, Supreme Court of the United States (2002)
   - Note on Vouchers since Zelman

B. Europe

- X v. The United Kingdom, European Commission of Human Rights (1978)

III. RELIGION IN THE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

A. The Human Rights Framework of Freedom of Religion and Education

B. The United States

1. School Prayer
   - Moments of Silence
   - Prayer at Public School Graduation Ceremonies: Lee v. Weisman, Supreme Court of the United States (1992)

2. Bible Reading: The Line between Inculcating Religion and Acknowledging Culture 519
   • Teaching about Religion Versus Teaching Religion 520

3. Evolution and Creation Science 522

4. School Facilities and Equal Access 523
   • The Equal Access Act 524

C. Europe 528
   1. Religious Challenge to Compulsory Sex Education: Kjeldsen, Busk Madsen and Pedersen v. Denmark, European Court of Human Rights (1976) 528
   4. Right of Alevis to Exemptions from Compulsory Religious Education in Turkey: Case of Hasan and Eleym Zengin v. Turkey, European Court of Human Rights (2007) 531

D. Japan 536
   • Exemption from Participating in Gym Class Swordplay: Japanese Kendo Case, Supreme Court of Japan (1996) 536

E. Germany 537
   • German School Prayer Case, German Constitutional Court (1979) 537
   • Classroom Crucifix II Case, Federal Constitutional Court of Germany (1995) 542
   • Note on the Impact of the Crucifix II Case 546

F. South Africa 547
   • National Policy on Religion and Education 547
14 RELIGION AND PUBLIC LIFE 551

I. INTRODUCTION 551

II. THE DEBATE ABOUT THE APPROPRIATE ROLE OF RELIGION IN PUBLIC LIFE 551
   A. John Rawls and Public Reason 551
   B. Ecumenical Dialogue 553
      • Michael Perry, Ecumenical Politics 553
      • Michael Perry, Ecumenical Dialogue 555
   C. Created in the Image of God 555
      • Jeremy Waldron, The War on Terror and the Image of God 556

III. RELIGIOUS INFLUENCE IN POLITICS 562
   A. United States 562
      1. Religious Qualifications for Office 562
         • Prohibition of Religious Tests 562
         • Unconstitutionality of State Prohibiting Clergy from Holding Elective Office 562
         • McDaniel v. Paty, Supreme Court of the United States (1978) 562
         • Note on Religious Prohibitions on Clergy Holding Public Office 566
      2. Religious Involvement in Political Issues and Major National Debates 567
         • Limitations on Political Activities of Churches 567
         • The Role of Religion in the Justification and Eradication of Slavery 568
         • Jon Meacham, American Gospel: God, the Founding Fathers, and the Making of a Nation 568
         • Richard Carwardine, Lincoln: A Life of Purpose and Power 568
         • The Role of Religion in the Civil Rights Movement 569
         • Martin Luther King, Jr., “I Have a Dream” 569
         • Martin Luther King, Jr., Letter from Birmingham Jail 570
         • Religious Influence on Abortion Policy 572
         • Harris v. McRae, Supreme Court of the United States (1980) 572
         • Irish Law Reflecting Catholic Church’s Prohibitions Concerning Divorce 573
      3. Civil Religion: Religion in Public Ceremonies and Pronouncements 574
         • Note on the National Motto 574
B. Europe
   • Religiously Affiliated Political Parties and Democratic Order 575

IV. RELIGIOUS SYMBOLS ON PUBLIC PROPERTY 581
   A. United States 581
      • Constitutionality of Displays of the Ten Commandments on Public Property 581
      • Van Orden v. Perry, U.S. Supreme Court (2005) 582
      • Cross on Public Property: Salazar v. Buono and Pleasant Grove City, Utah v. Summum 585
   B. Europe 587
      • Italy: The Crucifix in Public Environments 587

Table of Cases 589
Index 595