ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

Sentencing Law and Policy
Cases, Statutes, and Guidelines
Fourth Edition

Nora V. Demleitner
Roy L. Steinheimer, Jr. Professor of Law
Washington and Lee University School of Law

Douglas A. Berman
Robert J. Watkins/Procter & Gamble Professor of Law
The Ohio State University
Moritz College of Law

Marc L. Miller
Dean and Ralph W. Bilby Professor of Law
The University of Arizona
James E. Rogers College of Law

Ronald F. Wright
Needham Yancy Gulley Professor of Criminal Law
Wake Forest University School of Law
## Summary of Contents

### Contents
- Preface xi
- Acknowledgments xix
- Preface xxv
- 1. The Purposes of Punishment and Sentencing 1
- 2. Who Sentences? 73
- 3. Regulating Discretion 125
- 5. Sentencing Inputs: The Offender’s Record and Background 279
- 6. Procedure and Proof at Sentencing 367
- 7. Sentencing Outcomes: The Scale of Imprisonment 407

### Table of Cases
- 471

### Table of Statutes, Rules, and Guidelines
- 475

### Index
- 479
--- 1 ---

The Purposes of Punishment and Sentencing

A. SOCIAL PURPOSES OF SENTENCING 2
1. Stated Purposes 3
   a. Purposes Statutes 3
      ABA Standards for Criminal Justice, Sentencing 3
      18-2.1 3
      18 United States Code §3553 6
      Tennessee Code §40-35-102 6
      Notes 7
      Problem 1-1. Richard Graves 11
      Montana Code Annotated §46-18-101 12
      Notes 13
   b. Community Purposes 18
      A Healing Circle in the Innu Community of Sheshashit 20
      Notes 25
      Problem 1-2. Red Hook Community Court 27
2. Implicit Purposes 27
   Purposes and Functions of Sentencing, Michael Tonry 28
   Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison, Michel Foucault 31
   Notes 35

B. PURPOSES IN PRACTICAL CONTEXT 37
1. Use of Purposes in Sentencing an Individual Offender 38
   The Queen v. Robert James Arnautovic 39
   Notes 47
   Problem 1-3. Bromley Heath 48
2. Use of Purposes in System Components 48

xi
3. Politics, Philosophy, and Economics ("PP&E")
   a. Equality/Disparity Concerns
      ABA Standards for Criminal Justice, Sentencing 18-2.5
      Notes
   b. Cents and Sentencing Ability
      The Conservative Case for Reform
      Notes
      Problem 1-4. Sentencing without Prison or Death
      Problem 1-5. Sentencing Budgets
   c. Public Sentiment
      Myths and Misconceptions: Public Opinion versus Public Judgment about Sentencing, Karen Gelb
      Notes
      Problem 1-6. Crime in America

—— 2 ——

Who Sentences?

Research on Sentencing: The Search for Reform, Alfred Blumstein, Jacqueline Cohen, Susan Martin, and Michael Tonry
Notes
A. SENTENCING IN THE COURTROOM
   1. Judges and Parole Boards in Indeterminate Sentencing
      *Samuel Williams v. New York*
      Notes
      Problem 2-1. Determining the Indeterminable
      The Parole Process in Georgia
      Problem 2-2. Savings Plan
      Notes
   2. Sentencing Juries
      Arkansas Code §16-97-101 Felony Jury Trials;
      Guilt and Sentencing Phases
      Arkansas Code §16-97-103 Relevant Evidence
      Arkansas Code §16-90-107 Punishment;
      Juries and Courts
      Notes
B. LEGISLATURES AND COMMISSIONS
   Code of Hammurabi
   Mandatory Minimum Penalties in the Federal Criminal Justice System
Regulating Discretion

A. ORIGINS OF SENTENCING GUIDELINE STRUCTURES 126
   Criminal Sentences: Law Without Order, Marvin E. Frankel 126
   Notes 131

B. DEVELOPMENT AND STRUCTURE OF STATE GUIDELINE SYSTEMS 134
   Structuring Criminal Sentencing, Dale Parent 135
   Notes 138
   Problem 3-1. The Minnesota Machine 140
   Sentencing Guidelines in Minnesota, Other States, and the Federal Courts: A Twenty-Year Retrospective, Richard S. Frase 142
   Notes 147

C. STRUCTURE OF THE FEDERAL SENTENCING GUIDELINES 148
   Notes 154
   Federal Sentencing: The Basics 155
   Notes 161

D. DEPARTURES AND DISCRETION UNDER THE FEDERAL GUIDELINES 163
   Substantial Assistance: An Empirical Yardstick Gauging Equity in Current Federal Policy and Practice, Linda Drazga Maxfield and John H. Kramer 165
   Notes 167
### E. ADVISORY GUIDELINES: THE AFTERMATH OF BOOKER

*United States v. Freddie J. Booker*  
Notes 170

*Derrick Kimbrough v. United States*  
Notes 184

### F. DEPARTURES AND VARIANCES IN FEDERAL PRACTICE

*U.S. Sentencing Commission, Special Post-Booker Coding Project: Cases Sentenced Subsequent to United States v. Booker (July 6, 2006)*  
Notes 200

Problem 3-2. New Constitutional Guidelines 202

---

**Sentencing Inputs: The Crime and Its Effects**

Problem 4-1. Rob Anon 205

### A. WHICH CRIME?

1. Real Offense Versus Conviction Offense
   - U.S. Sentencing Guidelines Manual 208
   - *United States v. Vernon Watts*  
   - *Charles Frederick Barr v. State*  
   - Notes 214
   - Problem 4-2. Rob Anon Revisited 220

2. Multiple Convictions  
   - Problem 4-3. Take Two  
   - North Carolina General Statutes §15A-1340.15  
   - Kansas Statutes §21-6819  
   - Problem 4-4. Predisposed to Prison 223
   - Notes 224

3. Role in a Group Offense  
   - U.S. Sentencing Guidelines Manual 227
   - *United States v. Donald Carpenter*  
   - Notes 231
   - Problem 4-5. Rob Anon Revisited 232

### B. ASSESSING OFFENSE SERIOUSNESS

- U.S. Senate Report No. 98-225 233
- Notes 234

1. Qualitative Assessments of Harm
   - *Ehrlich Anthony Coker v. Georgia*  
   - Notes 236
   - *Patrick Kennedy v. Louisiana*  
   - Notes 240
   - *State v. Stanley Rosser*  
   - U.S. Sentencing Guidelines Manual 250
   - Notes 252
   - Problem 4-6. Rob Anon Revisited 254
2. Quantitative Assessments of Harm
   Richard Chapman v. United States
   Notes
   Problem 4-7. Getting Tough on Drunk Drivers
3. The Role of Mens Rea and Motive
   a. Strict Liability Sentencing Factors
      United States v. Ana Marin de Velasquez
      Notes
   b. Hate Crimes and the Relevance of Motive
      Wisconsin v. Todd Mitchell
      Notes
   Problem 4-8. Rob Anon (aka Jean Valjean?) Revisited
C. THE ROLE OF VICTIMS AND THE COMMUNITY
   State v. Rasheed Muhammad
   Notes

--- 5 ---

Sentencing Inputs: The Offender’s Record and Background

Problem 5-1. Rob Anon

A. PRIOR CRIMINAL RECORD
   1. “Strikes” Laws and Other Mandatory Rules
      People v. Jerry Garcia
      Notes
   2. Complicated Criminal Records
      United States v. Anthony Croom
      Notes
   3. “Violent Crime” Recidivist Enhancements
      Samuel Johnson v. United States
      Notes
   4. The First-Time Offender
      Washington Revised Code §9.94A.650
      State v. Joshua Fowler
      Notes
B. THE COOPERATIVE DEFENDANT
   1. Acceptance of Responsibility and Plea Bargains
      State v. David Tiernan
      Powers of Criminal Courts (Sentencing) Act
      Notes
   2. Substantial Assistance
      United States v. Amanda Williams
      Nevada Revised Statutes §453.3405(2)
      Problem 5-2. Helping Others
      Problem 5-3. Earned Time
      Notes
## C. THE OFFENDER’S CHARACTER AND CIRCUMSTANCES 322

1. Immutable Characteristics
   - ABA Standards for Criminal Justice, Sentencing 18-3.4(d) 326
   - *Evan Miller v. Alabama* 326
   - Notes 337

2. Circumstances Within the Defendant’s Control
   - *Brian Michael Gall v. United States* 341
   - Problem 5-5. Treatment and Timing 349
   - Problem 5-6. Restitution and Rehabilitation 349
   - Notes 350

3. Social Context of the Offender
   - *United States v. Fadya Husein* 353
   - Notes 362
   - Problem 5-7. Pillar of the Community 364
   - Notes 365

## A. FORMAL TRIAL, INFORMAL SENTENCING 368

1. The Prison as an American Innovation
   - *The Future of Imprisonment*, Norval Morris 408
   - Notes 410

## B. THE RESURGENT JURY TRIAL RIGHT 377

1. Problem 6-1. Moving Violations 390
   - Problem 6-2. The Capital Jury 391
   - Notes 392

## C. REBUILDING GUIDELINE PROCEDURES 394

1. Problem 6-3. Prior Juvenile Adjudications 400
   - Notes 401

## 6

### Procedure and Proof at Sentencing 367

### A. FORMAL TRIAL, INFORMAL SENTENCING 368

- *Dynel McMillan v. Pennsylvania* 370
- Notes 373

### B. THE RESURGENT JURY TRIAL RIGHT 377

- *Ralph Blakely, Jr. v. Washington* 377
- Notes 387

### C. REBUILDING GUIDELINE PROCEDURES 394

- *State v. Abdul Abdullah* 395
- Problem 6-3. Prior Juvenile Adjudications 400
- Notes 401

## 7

### Sentencing Outcomes: The Scale of Imprisonment 407

### A. INCARCERATION TRENDS 407

1. The Prison as an American Innovation
   - *The Future of Imprisonment*, Norval Morris 408
   - Notes 410

2. Prison Growth
   - Notes 412